

Minutes of the Extraordinary meeting of the Full Council, held in the Council Chamber County Hall, Chelmsford, Essex on Tuesday, 12 March 2019

Present:

Chairman: Councillor J G Jowers
Vice-Chairman: Councillor E C Johnson

J Abbott	A Goggin	G Mohindra
J F Aldridge	R J Gooding	Dr R Moore
B Aspinell	I Grundy	J Moran
J Baker	C Guglielmi	M Platt
T Ball	D Harris	C Pond
S Barker	A M Hedley	R Pratt
J Beavis	I Henderson	J M Reeves
K Bentley	J Henry	P Reid
A Brown	S Hillier	S Robinson
M Buckley	P Honeywood	C Sargeant
G Butland	A Jackson	L Scordis
S Canning	D J Kendall	A Sheldon
J Chandler	S Lissimore	K Smith
P Channer	D Louis	C Souter
T Cutmore	M Mackrory	J Spence
A Davies	R A Madden	M Steptoe
J Deakin	M Maddocks	A Turrell
M Durham	B Massey	L Wagland
B Egan	P May	S Walsh
A Erskine	M McEwen	C Weston
D Finch	L McKinlay	C Whitbread
R Gadsby	V Metcalfe	A Wood
M Garnett	R Mitchell	J A Young

Prayers

The meeting was preceded by prayers led by The Right Reverend Hugh Allan O. Praem, the Titular Abbot of Beeleigh and Chaplain to the Chairman of Essex County Council.

Welcome and Introduction

The Chairman of the Council, Councillor Jowers welcomed the members of the public to the meeting and reminded them to ask the question as it had been submitted to the clerk. He invited them thereafter to stay for the remainder of the meeting or leave if they so wished.

The Chairman also reminded all those present that the meeting was held in public and the debate would also be audio broadcast. He added that in a break from the usual practice he had permitted the recording and broadcasting of the public question time.

Public Questions

Speaker 1: The Chairman welcomed Ms Scott, a resident of Wivenhoe, who had submitted a question concerning the disproportionate effects on children and the elderly and the assessment of impact on women. She had asked:

‘My question is in regard to the sections of the population most disadvantaged by the planned closure of the libraries. In your own document you show that children and people over 65 are the ones who will be disproportionately affected by the closures and you offer no mitigation of the impact on those groups. In fact you offer no explanation of what the impact will be on those two groups, beyond the fact that they make up the largest proportion of library users.

43% of library users in Colchester are 19 and under, 23% are over 65. Also you admit that the number of people over 65 years old in Essex will increase by 61% by 2039 and the population will grow by at least 20%, so the damage of this attack on older people will increase.

My question is a personal question. I am not speaking on behalf of a group, but speaking in the many capacities in which I have an interest in the libraries staying open at the level of service currently offered and staffed by professional librarians.

As a woman resident, I am concerned as to how you can ignore the inequality of impact on women compared to men? Women make up the majority of users (by at least 2:1) of Tier 4 libraries such as Prettygate, Tier 3 libraries such as Wivenhoe, and of Tier 2 libraries across Essex. Men are the majority in Tier 1 hub libraries.

As a mother, teacher and grandmother, I am concerned at the fact that children will be deprived of books. It is well researched and documented that learning and the love of reading and studying will be impacted by loss of access to the library spaces, books, librarians and online services.

As a local politician I am concerned that community cohesion, public and social services are to be eroded by the loss of library safe spaces, staffed professionally.

As a volunteer running a social club for older people I am horrified by the loss of access to books, advice, online services and the consequent likely increase in social isolation and loneliness among the elderly. Volunteers will not be able to replace the current opening hours, there is only so much we can do - though we want to add value to the current offer.

So my question is, how will you repair and compensate for the admitted impact and disadvantage caused by library closures on this massive scale, at what cost - direct and indirect - social and educational - for children, women, and older people?’

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

‘A key theme that will be repeated today is that the current version of the Future Library Strategy is a draft for consultation. We won’t know the full impacts of the proposed strategy until we’ve analysed the 21,500 responses.

However, an initial draft Equalities Impact Assessment was undertaken before the consultation launched. This is a process designed to ensure that a policy, project or scheme does not discriminate against any disadvantaged or vulnerable people.

Please be assured, before any decision is taken, a more detailed Equalities Impact Assessment will be completed after we have analysed the consultation responses and considered the way forward in terms of detailed proposals. Once we’ve completed the assessment of impact, we will make sure that each potential impact has robust measures.

The mitigations for changes to Tier 3 and Tier 4 libraries could include:
A community run library in conjunction with

- New Outreach Services
- Mobile Library Route changes
- Use of the Home Library Service
- Improving the e-library offer

There have been lots of responses from the Community to run tier 3 & 4 libraries and this additional outreach would be on top of that.

Women are actually the majority of users in all tiers of libraries across Essex, making up approximately 58% of library users. Children under nine account for 23% of active library users; over 60s account for 22% of users.

The strategy is all about modernising the library service to make it relevant for all. It envisages a ‘service without walls,’ with activities such as Rhymetimes, literacy activities or reading groups taking place in village halls, schools, community centres or older people’s settings.

I have been told that the Rhymetime session at Southminster is actually

busier now that it is run in the local school than it was when it was in the library.

Thank you also for your comments on volunteers: initial feedback received is that thousands of people have contacted us to express interest in volunteering to support the library service, which is incredibly encouraging.'

Speaker 2: The Chairman welcomed Ms Miles, a resident of Wivenhoe, who had submitted a question concerning the impact on the education of children with learning difficulties. She had asked:

'I note that the strategy has included no impact assessment on the education of children with learning disabilities or other disabilities, no impact assessment on child reluctant readers and no impact assessment on pre-nursery children and the word gap (the word gap being recently identified by the current government as a significant child literacy/communications problem). The closure of tier 4 libraries and the downgrade of tier 3 libraries will mean there will be no guaranteed easy local access for children or parents to professional librarian guidance on books and no guaranteed relaxed and safe children's reading / book-sharing library space with appropriate books – in 44 communities, if your strategy goes through.

How does Essex County Council intend to guarantee providing replacement services in the relevant towns and villages in order not to have a negative effect on children's literacy and communications skills, and has an impact assessment been made on the indirect costs of failing to ensure good, out-of-school literacy services are provided?'

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

'We will continue to deliver Bookstart, which delivers free book packs to all children at age one, three and 4-5. All children are entitled to the packs. Tailored packs for children with Special Educational Needs are also produced, such as braille books for blind children.

We will continue to offer a range of services for children with special educational needs and disabilities. These include sensory facilities, sensory story times and the promotion of volunteering opportunities to develop confidence.

We are also one of the largest authorities delivering the Summer Reading Challenge - an activity that encourages reading over the long summer break. This year's theme is Space Chase – inspired by the 50th anniversary of the moon landing. In 2020, perhaps we will celebrate 100 years since Marconi's first broadcast or 200 years since the Beagle or 400 years since the Mayflower.

The proposed Future Library Strategy also places a strong emphasis on outreach, allowing the library service to engage with a greater number of people of all ages in community settings.

Again, I would like to reassure you, as mentioned in my answer to the previous question, detailed Equality Impact Assessments will also be undertaken once detailed proposals have been drawn up following the analysis of the consultation responses.'

Speaker 3: The Chairman welcomed Mr Marsden-Carleton, a resident of Hullbridge, and Chairman of the Hullbridge Residents Association who had submitted a question concerning library closures. He had asked:

'We respectfully request an urgent review of your decision to highlight Hullbridge library as one of the casualties in your proposed plans. Please consider our information below, before your final deliberation.

We understand the Essex County Council's Futures Report – 2019 to 2024 and thank you for the opportunity to make our Voices heard (90% support from our 7,500 village population) and provide you with the following information.

We present our demographic distribution for 2018 and from 2019 to 2034 showing a sharp increase from what was the norm of 2.5% increase in the censuses up to census 2011. Our population is likely to expand to over 16,000 by 2034, as demonstrated below, an annual population increase of some 580 over a development period of 15 years and equates to an increase of 119%. A population of 8,000+ is generally classified as a "Town" changing the classification of Hullbridge. This change will have profound implications on the Local Government requirements.

The Demographic distribution of our population will increase as follows:

<u>Age</u>	<u>Pop 2018</u>		<u>Pop 2034</u>	<u>%</u>
0 to 16	1132	to	2562	16
17 to 65	4271	to	9289	58
66 to 84+	<u>1886</u>	to	<u>4163</u>	26
	<u>7289</u>		<u>16014</u>	

Any approval of your plans will affect our community of all ages. There is the possibility of expanding the services in accordance with your "Libraries Future Plan" and applaud your perceived ambition to improve the services provided by our libraries to facilitate services for all ages, so we will welcome formal consultation, which will allow the library to flourish in the future, with which many of our residents agree.

The Public Libraries and Museums Act 1964, as amended in 2012 under the Government Bill of 2010 – 2012 stipulates that a Library service to all is a Statutory obligation in England and Wales and we understand the Law.

In the light of the above evidence does the Cabinet Member agree that Hullbridge Library should be reclassified into Tier 1?’

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

‘Thank you for applauding our ambition and welcoming the chance to take part in the public consultation.

The statutory duty on all library authorities is to: “provide a comprehensive and efficient library service for all persons desiring to make use thereof”.

The sad fact is that the number of people desiring to make use of libraries in Essex has fallen by a third, down more than 100,000 in the last ten years. Now more than four out of five people in Essex don’t use libraries and book borrowing has more than halved. So we need to change how we deliver the service, to make it relevant and have wider appeal.

Legal guidance, published by the Government’s Libraries Taskforce, is that “comprehensive” cannot mean every resident lives close to a library but that it is accessible to residents using reasonable means, including digital.

The guidance also says an “efficient service must make the best use of the assets available within constraints on resources.”

Coming on to your point about population - population growth isn’t a reliable indicator of future demand for library services. Essex’s population grew significantly in the last 10 years and is forecast to keep growing almost everywhere. But library membership continues to decline.’

Speaker 4: The Chairman welcomed Ms Turner who had submitted a question concerning the Library Consultation, seeking evidence of engaging with core groups. She had asked:

‘In an email to me Cllr Barker stated that ECC “made every effort to engage with core user groups” regarding the consultation.

However, for example, a large residential placement for people with learning disabilities in Manningtree had no idea about the consultation or the easy read copies of the survey. Elderly residents up to this day are still commenting to campaigners that they are unaware of the threat to our libraries and also your consultation. This is only compounded by the fact that libraries did not hold paper copies of the consultation till 15/02 so there was nothing for library staff to share with users when they visited.

Whilst you held “drop ins” at the libraries, these were not widely advertised and appeared to hold little value to the process.

So going back to the point that was emailed to me, could you please explain how you made an effort to engage with core user groups, and what evidence

can you provide to prove to the public that you have reached every demographic of users within the consultation process?’

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

‘We aimed to engage with as many groups as possible. We wrote to:

- All active library users,
- the vast majority of groups and organisations that use libraries or have a relationship with the library service,
- the 12 city, district and borough councils,
- all town and parish councils and
- all schools.

Publicity was made available to all these groups to share with their networks. The consultation was advertised in all libraries and was widely covered in all local media, including TV and radio.

Social media posts about the consultation reached 300,000 people. Notices and reminders were sent out in 17 ECC e-bulletins, reaching 128,000 subscribers.

Information drop-ins were held in libraries cross the County. Paper copies, as well as large print and Easy Read were available on request from the start of consultation to anybody who wanted them.

I am sorry the residential placement in Manningtree was unaware of the consultation, but whilst we did not and could not promise to reach everyone, I do believe we made every effort to raise awareness of the consultation, and that the channels available meant that every demographic of users had the opportunity to respond to it.

Analysis of the survey results will include demographic analysis.’

Speaker 5: The Chairman welcomed Mr Hyland, a resident of Chelmsford, who had submitted a question concerning the Library Consultation. He had asked:

‘It seems, to me, incredibly short-sighted of Essex County Council to set out on this path of destruction of Essex Libraries.

I hope the public response to the planned cuts and the library consultation, has provided you with the compelling message, of both the popularity of public libraries and their impact on wider social issues including health and wellbeing, education, poverty, loneliness and digital skills.

I hope, having undertaken this latest public consultation, it has given you a refreshing insight, to the value placed in libraries by residents.

And I hope you are now willing and able, to take this opportunity to change

direction, act in the public interest, use your duty of care to avoid perpetuating this public fear, division and discord, that has sought to set communities against each other to battle for resources.

Essex County Council must stop the Library Services cuts now and budget/move monies from contingency and turn their minds to creating a long-term sustainable funding plan for libraries.

If you thought extra funding was required, on top of the taxes we already pay for these our Library Services, you should consider raising taxes to bring a sustainable outcome, and let residents know at what cost this would be per person/per household in tax increases.

Once again, we see the out of touch Tories at Essex County Council "know the cost of everything and the value of nothing."

So, I would like to ask Essex County Council to provide to me and the residents of Essex a verifiable full cost benefit, and wider impact analysis of options, including to remain as-is?

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

'We haven't made any decisions yet and are not going to until we've had a chance to analyse the consultation results and look in more detail at the impacts of our proposals and the opportunities they present.

The strategy we consulted on is about responding to changing demands and providing a library service that meets needs for it and is relevant and fit for the future.

This may include new Libraries in new Communities across the County as our population grows.

More information about the costs and benefits of our proposals and the options will be published to inform the Cabinet meeting in the summer.'

Speaker 6: The Chairman welcomed Ms Mawer, a resident of Thaxted, who had submitted a question concerning the Library Closures. She had asked:

'There is little or no recognition in the ECC library Proposal of the important role libraries can - and should - play in the cultural and creative life of the community. This aspect of personal and social development ranks highly in the 'Ambition for Libraries' document (Department DCMS).

Why is there no vision for libraries being centres for culture, the arts and creativity in Essex? Is it not considered important or is a natural casualty of a proposal that reduces the number of libraries?'

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

‘Culture, the arts and creativity will remain part of our core offer. We will continue to support:

- The Essex Book Festival each March, which hosts over 100 events in over 45 venues across the county, including libraries.
- Essex Poetry Festival.
- The Summer Reading Challenge
- Theatre events and artist workshops e.g. Spinning Wheel Theatre is putting on a play at four libraries this month

The library service is also currently developing a bid with cultural partners in the Eastern Region for funding from Arts Council England to create a programme of activity co-produced with young people.

Despite all this, we’d love to hear more ideas from residents like yourself who are passionate about culture, about how we can achieve even more.’

Speaker 7: The Chairman welcomed Mr Robertson, who had submitted a question concerning the apparent lack of diligence relating to the easy read consultation and the offence caused. He had asked:

‘What due diligence was undertaken in relation to the easy read consultation on the changes to the library services and will Essex County Council be attempting to get a full refund of the cost of this consultation given the offensive nature of the material that caused great distress to the transgender community?’

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

‘The Easy Read version of the strategy and survey were produced to enable people with learning disabilities to participate in the consultation.

It was produced by Inclusive Communication Essex (ICE), an ECC service which specialises in producing EasyRead materials and advising on how to support people with learning disabilities.

They involved people with learning disabilities throughout the development of the Easyread version to ensure it would be appropriate for the target audience.

All materials produced by the ICE team are in accordance with national government guidance from the Office for Disability Issues, as well as national human rights organisation, CHANGE.

Questions about gender identity were included in both surveys to ensure transgender people were included, not excluded

The image that caused offence came from an organisation called Inspired

Services, who work with people with learning disabilities to produce images for easy read publications.

The image was removed quickly once we were aware it had caused offence and we apologised for any offence caused. I am happy to repeat that apology and I thank those who expressed concern for their feedback.

The easy read survey was used by its target audience so no, at this time, we will not be seeking a refund.'

Speaker 8: The Chairman welcomed Ms Patten, who had submitted a question concerning groups or persons with Special Needs not taken into account. She had asked:

'I am concerned about the threatened closure of two thirds of Essex County Council Libraries.

Most libraries have twelve clubs and activity groups which can meet in the safe environment of the library, along with active library card users withdrawing books or browsing on the computers.

However, a few years ago the library opening hours were halved and the number of books available have been reduced. I know this from being a member of a Book Club. Fifteen members in the Book Club only need ONE ticket (not fifteen tickets) to withdraw fifteen books about once a month. This used to equate to nearly 200 book withdrawals per year. With less books being stocked, the library can now only manage to produce a total of 8 - 10 of the same book per month.

All these types of groups are self-motivated providing the members with social contact, education and entertainment.

Any closures will cause social isolation and depression to young mothers with babies, the elderly and the vulnerable; the unemployed and the disabled. The literacy of children and youth will be badly damaged. This will place more pressure onto the health professionals and the police. The needs of these groups and people with specific needs have not been taken into account when preparing the Strategy.

Why were these groups not included in the strategy for your consultation?

We want a public library service with trained librarians and a community hub provided from our taxes. Amongst other ideas, a coffee/tea/snacks machine could be installed which would produce some revenue for the Council.'

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

‘All groups that use libraries, such as book clubs, coding clubs and knit and natter groups were invited to complete the consultation, where we had their contact details

As previously mentioned, the consultation on the Future Library Strategy was extensively advertised and efforts have been made to engage with a wide range of different demographic groups.

It is important to wait and see what the feedback is from these groups and also what the result of the Equality Impact Assessment is before we make any decisions.’

Speaker 9: The Chairman welcomed Dr Tayler, a resident of Thaxted who had submitted a question concerning the impact of the closure of Libraries on safeguarding issues. He had asked:

‘As someone who has been responsible for the care of people who may have safeguarding needs or are experiencing domestic abuse, has the consultation by ECC into libraries given adequate weight to the importance that libraries may offer in issues of safeguarding, and disclosure of domestic abuse, especially in rural communities and would this include the appropriate training of librarians?’

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

‘In Thaxted and across the county there are many other community buildings and services where people can seek help and support services can be provided.

Whilst our libraries staff do a fantastic job supporting the community and offering safe spaces they are not trained to support people experiencing domestic abuse.

Our Home Library Service will continue and staff will continue to report any safeguarding issues.

We will continue to grow our outreach service and encourage communities and partners to get involved.’

Speaker 10: The Chairman welcomed Ms Vargas, a representative of SOLE Colchester, the local branch of the Save Our Libraries Essex campaign who had submitted a question concerning population growth. She had asked:

‘Assuming that every tier 3 library in Essex manages to remain open with a service comparable to that provided now, Essex will have on average just one library per 31,000 people, without taking into account the forecast population growth of 20%, compared to the national average of around 1 per 22,000.

If tier 3 close or provide only a minimal service, this could drop to 1 per 49,000, which is almost half the current lowest county provision in England, and to just 1 per 95,000 in Colchester.

What research and/or advice has ECC looked at on minimum or optimal ratios of population per library and their impact on accessibility, usage and sustainability, and was this used to work out and plan a particular level of provision for each area of Essex?’

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

‘The national average referred to is based on 2016/17 figures for English county library authorities. Since this information was published we know that other local authorities have reviewed library services and populations have grown and will continue to grow – so this national average is now out of date.

There is no national guidance on minimal or optimal ratios of population per library.

Population growth isn’t a reliable indicator of future demand for library services. Essex’s population grew significantly in the last 10 years, and is forecast to keep growing almost everywhere. But library membership continues to tumble.

The sad fact is that the number of people desiring to make use of libraries in Essex has fallen by a third, down more than 100,000 in the last ten years. Now more than four out of five people in Essex don’t use libraries and book borrowing has more than halved.

We are currently considering the consultation survey response before proposing a final strategy so are unable to provide the library per head of population ratio at the moment.’

Speaker 11: The Chairman welcomed Councillor Caton, Chairman of Stansted Mountfitchet Parish Council, who had submitted a question concerning the new community hub in the village. She asked that:

‘Before contracts were signed by Stansted Mountfitchet Parish Council to build a new Community Hub building in the village, Essex County Council signed a Heads of Agreement to lease part of the building, as the new village Library, at an annual rental of £13,000 and an annual contribution of £7,000 contribution towards the building’s overheads for a ten-year period.

Does the County Council intend to honour this agreement?’

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

'As you are aware, Essex County Council has offered to take a one year lease and cover all costs to relocate Stansted Library into the parish council's new community hub and Stansted Mountfitchet Parish Council has accepted this.

We hope this can happen by early April.

This is a temporary arrangement as we cannot make a long-term commitment until we know the outcome of the consultation and the shape of the final strategy.

We'll be happy to continue dialogue once the final strategy is approved.

We had discussed proposed terms but no binding commitment was made before we had to put things on hold for the consultation period.'

Speaker 12: The Chairman welcomed Councillor Edwards, Toddbrook Ward, Harlow District Council, who had submitted a question concerning Health and Wellbeing Policies. He had asked:

'Have the County Council's Health and Wellbeing Policies been explicitly taken into account within the Strategy For Libraries and if so how?'

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

'Our ambition is for an inclusive and vibrant 21st century library service supports the shared vision in the Joint Health and Wellbeing Strategy - *We want everybody in Essex to live well together.*

Library services have and will continue to play a key role in enabling people in Essex to live well together...

- providing physical space where people can read, learn and come together for social and health-related activities;
- through outreach activities in communities;
- through continued access to books, reading and materials;
- through its improved digital offering;
- and through better and more frequent join up with other council services or community groups that promote the council's health and wellbeing priorities.

We acknowledge libraries' positive impacts on health and wellbeing in the community and fully intend, through the proposed strategy, to further enhance that.'

Speaker 13: The Chairman welcomed Ms Fletcher, a resident of Chelmsford, who had submitted a question concerning children's education and wellbeing. She had asked:

'I was a Children's Librarian for Essex libraries for a number of years latterly on the Children's Central Team. I passionately believe that books, libraries and reading are essential for children's education, imagination, wellbeing and life prospects.

Research, some of which I was involved in, has proved that Libraries are good social spaces for women with young children; that library visits and taking part in the Summer Reading Challenge support children's literacy, which improves their educational opportunities. Also, libraries are excellent safe social spaces for children and young people as they learn and study.

Does the Cabinet Member agree that many, many children in Essex will in future be deprived of opportunities to read, learn and grow their imaginations, which will affect their future career and job prospects?'

The Cabinet Member for Customer and Corporate, Councillor Barker, replied that:

'No, the strategy is looking to widen the appeal of the library service and make it more accessible and reflective of today's society.

We will continue to provide a comprehensive and efficient library service for the people of Essex, but it is proposed that this will be delivered in a new ways, with a greater emphasis on outreach and new technologies.

The strategy proposes modernising the library service to make it relevant for all age groups. It envisages more activities taking place in village halls, schools, nurseries and community centres, run by both the library service and volunteers, such as Rhymetimes, literacy activities or reading groups.

As previously mentioned, a wide range of cultural activity that promotes children's literacy will continue to be supported and expanded throughout the course of this strategy.'

Councillor Jowers formally opened the meeting

1. Apologies for Absence

Apologies for absence were received on behalf of Councillors Blackwell, Hardware, Lumley and Schmitt.

2. Declarations of Interest

Councillor Pond declared a Code Interest as an Honorary Fellow of the Chartered Institute of Librarians and Information Practitioners.

3. Motion to Council

The future of Essex Libraries

It was moved by Councillor Mackrory and seconded by Councillor Young that

‘Council notes:

The overwhelming public and political opposition, including from MPs, to the closure or reduction in opening hours of any Essex Library.

The total number of signatures on petitions, currently 57,000, which very comfortably exceeds the threshold for debate.

This Council therefore:

calls on the Cabinet to rule out any such closures, and to commit to maintaining all 74 libraries by encouraging their better use as community hubs and to maximise the use of the buildings and sites to generate income for the Library Service.’

It was moved by Councillor Finch and seconded by Councillor Bentley that the motion be amended to read as follows:

‘Council notes:

1. The use of Essex Libraries is changing and that this change is accelerating.
2. That there is an obligation on the administration to ensure that the library service meets the current and future needs of the residents of Essex and represents good value for money for Essex taxpayers.
3. That there have been high levels of public and political engagement, including from MPs, to the consultation on the Essex Future Library Services Strategy. This includes the total number of signatures on petitions, approximately 57,000 and over 21,000 consultation responses.
4. The consultation has only just closed and that it will be some time before the evidence from the consultation is fully analysed and any decision put forward to the Cabinet.

Given the level of interest in this consultation, this Council calls on the Cabinet Member for Corporate and Customer to:

continue to explore the opportunity to use all libraries as community hubs and to maximise the use of the buildings and sites to generate income for the Library Service.’

Ten Members having stood in their places the amendment to the motion was put to a named vote and was **carried** by 50 votes for, 19 against and 2 abstentions.

Those Members voting for the amendment to the motion were Councillors:

Aldridge	Garnett	Metcalfe
Ball	Goggin	Mitchell
Barker	Gooding	Mohindra
Beavis	Grundy	Moore
Bentley	Guglielmi	Moran
Brown	Hedley	Platt
Buckley	Henry	Pratt
Butland	Hillier	Reeves
Canning	Honeywood	Sheldon
Chandler	Jackson	Souter
Channer	Lissimore	Spence
Cutmore	Louis	Steptoe
Durham	Madden	Wagland
Egan	Maddocks	Walsh
Erskine	Massey	Weston
Finch	McEwan	Whitbread
Gadsby	McKinlay	

Those Members voting against the amendment to the motion were Councillors:

Abbott	Kendall	Sargeant
Aspinell	Mackrory	Scordis
Baker	May	Smith
Davies	Pond	Turrell
Deakin	Reid	Wood
Harris	Robinson	Young
Henderson		

Councillors Johnson and Jowers abstained.

The motion as amended having become the substantive motion and ten members having stood in their places it was put to a named vote and was **carried** by 50 votes for, 19 against and 2 abstentions.

Those Members voting for the amendment to the motion were Councillors:

Aldridge	Garnett	Metcalfe
Ball	Goggin	Mitchell
Barker	Gooding	Mohindra
Beavis	Grundy	Moore
Bentley	Guglielmi	Moran
Brown	Hedley	Platt
Buckley	Henry	Pratt
Butland	Hillier	Reeves
Canning	Honeywood	Sheldon
Chandler	Jackson	Souter
Channer	Lissimore	Spence
Cutmore	Louis	Steptoe
Durham	Madden	Wagland
Egan	Maddocks	Walsh
Erskine	Massey	Weston
Finch	McEwan	Whitbread
Gadsby	McKinlay	

Those Members voting against the amendment to the motion were Councillors:

Abbott	Kendall	Sargeant
Aspinell	Mackrory	Scordis
Baker	May	Smith
Davies	Pond	Turrell
Deakin	Reid	Wood
Harris	Robinson	Young
Henderson		

Councillors Johnson and Jowers abstained.

The meeting ended at 1.02pm.

Chairman
14 May 2019